

**Renew My Church—Evanston Grouping**  
**GS4 Scenario Strength / Challenges**  
**Summary of Facilitator Notes from October 4, 2021 Meeting**  
**Draft as of October 6**

**Scenario 1 – Three parishes/entities (A’s/Joan/Mary) (Nicholas) (Sheil)**

Strengths

- Meets the Foundational Principles required for mass attendance and total revenues
- Sheil Center retains its independence to pursue its mission
- Ability to leverage assets
- Includes diversity across three parishes
  - Diversity may be amplified by three worship sites remaining open
- Avoids the potential perception of ‘winners vs. losers’
- Neutralizes school discussion and might provide more support for the two existing schools at St. A’s and St. Joan. In general, supports Catholic Education in Evanston (rather than focus on individual schools).
- Business efficiencies

Challenges

- Overhead expense reduction won’t occur (be realized) if all three worship sites remain open
- High maintenance / repair expense if all three worship sites remain open
- Potential loss of revenue if one or more worship sites is closed
- Difficulty of merging three parishes? versus two?
  - Potential adverse impact on the two schools?
- Difficulty of one pastor serving three worship sites
- Ease of access if a worship site near public transportation closes for people that need/use that

**Scenario 2 – Three parishes/entities (A’s/Joan) (Mary/Nicholas) (Sheil)**

Strengths

- Further expands / codifies some existing partnerships
- Relative to Scenario 1, has greater pastoral possibilities
- Preserves some diversity that exists at St. Nick’s/ St. Mary’s
- Sheil Center retains independence to pursue its mission
- Leverages what is working at St. Nicks to a broader population.
- Meets Foundational Principles
- Keeping all four worship sites open may retain attendance and revenue
  - A risk of parishioners going to northern parishes (outside Evanston community) if St. A’s closes
  - Keeps Catholicism strong with Evanston community

### Challenges

- If a worship site closes, people may choose a non-Catholic option, which are prolific in Evanston
- If a worship site closes, loyal Catholics may feel not heard or listened to
- Consolidates more a lack of diversity that exists today – will this split Evanston into a Caucasian north versus more diverse south?
- Risk of diluting cultural differences that exist between parishes
- St. A's / St. Joan – logistical challenge of two schools

### **Scenario 3 – Three parishes/entities (A's/Joan) (Nicholas) (Mary/Sheil)**

#### Strengths

- Tapping into (leveraging) the positive energy at Sheil
- Sheil / St. Mary's might become a more permanent home for students once they graduate
- Expands / codifies some existing relationships and partnerships
- Makes geographic sense
- Avoids the perception of Evanston being divided north versus south

#### Challenges

- Struggle over conflicting priorities of two competing missions (St. Mary's / Sheil)
- Might not resolve financial challenges faced by St. Mary's
- Unclear if Northwestern University would support a combined St. Mary's / Sheil and the impact on the dual campus facilities (Evanston and Chicago).

### **Scenario 4 – Three parishes/entities (Joan/Mary) (Nicholas) (A's/Sheil)**

#### Strengths

- Lack of history between St. Mary's / St. Joan – starting from scratch / less baggage
- Makes the school situation easier (St. Mary's / St. Joan – one school)
- Looks like all are in this together – all have to give something
- Geography – doesn't make it look like St. Nick's and everyone else

#### Challenges

- St. Joan / St. Mary's operating deficit concerns
- Sheil dilution of mission, Chicago site, etc...